

State of New York  
County of Fulton  
Town of Caroga

Minutes of the Town Board Work Session held Thursday May 12, 2017. The meeting was held at Caroga Town hall with the following persons in attendance.

Beth Morris – Supervisor  
John Glenn – Council Member  
Anthony Sturchio – Council Member  
Jeremy Manning – Council Member

Also present James Mraz from Fulton County Planning Department, and four members of the public.

Supervisors Morris opened the meeting at 7:03 pm with the salute to the flag.

There were 8 proposals for the Conceptual Engineering Evaluation on Developing a Wastewater Collection and Treatment System.

Delaware Engineering  
Barton & Loguidice  
Environmental Design Partnership  
C. T/ Male  
Lamont Engineers  
The Chazen Companies  
Laberge Group  
MJ Engineering and Land Surveying P.C.

Mr. Mraz stated it has taken us several months to get to this point following a previous meeting

Council Member Sturchio stated he did not get to read all of the proposals.

Mr. Mraz noted the proposals were geared toward our town center, as stated in the Comprehensive Plan. The wastewater collection system can be added on to in the future. The plan is based on receiving funding from Senator Jim Tedesco.

To recap, Mr. Mraz sent out RFP's to 12 companies and got back 8. He noted that was a good response back.

Mr. Mraz prepared and reviewed a summary of proposals received sheet with the board.

See the next page.

## TOWN OF CAROGA WASTEWATER EVALUATION

### Summary of Proposals Received

4/26/17

**1. TOTAL FEE:**

FIRM	SERVICE AREA	WASTEWATER COLLECTION SYSTEM	WASTEWATER TREATMENT SYSTEM	SUMMARY REPORT	REIMB. EXPENSES	TOTAL FEE
Delaware Engineering	\$ 1,860	\$ 2,100	\$ 1,720	\$ 1,600	\$ 250	\$ 7,530
Barton & Loguidice	\$ 620	\$ 2,390	\$ 2,830	\$ 3,050	\$ 710	\$ 9,600
Environmental Design Partnership	\$ 2,400	\$ 2,200	\$ 4,100	\$ 2,100	\$ 500	\$11,300
C.T. Male Associates	\$ 5,008	\$ 2,504	\$ 2,340	\$ 2,990	\$ 480	\$13,322
Lamont Engineers	\$ 2,112	\$ 3,428	\$ 4,492	\$ 9,384	\$ 350	\$19,766
The Chazen Companies	\$ 2,803	\$ 4,202	\$ 7,232	\$ 5,363	\$ 250	\$19,850
Laberge Group	--	--	--	--	--	\$25,500
MJ Engineering and Land Surveying, P.C.	\$10,840	\$ 6,720	\$11,720	\$13,640	\$ 1,150	\$44,070

**2. TOTAL HOURS OF SERVICE**

FIRM	SERVICE AREA	WASTEWATER COLLECTION SYSTEM	WASTEWATER TREATMENT SYSTEM	SUMMARY REPORT	TOTAL HOURS	TOTAL FEE
Delaware Engineering	26	16	16	20	78	\$ 7,530
Barton & Loguidice	--	--	--	--	82	\$ 9,600
Environmental Design Partnership	19	18	32	17	86	\$11,300
C.T. Male Associates	48	24	18	26	116	\$13,322
Lamont Engineers	20	34	42	92	188	\$19,766
The Chazen Companies	31	50	64	59	204	\$19,850
Laberge Group	--	--	--	--	--	\$25,500
MJ Engineering and Land Surveying, P.C.	104	66	144	144	458	\$44,070

Mr. Mraz stated all of the firms are qualified to do this work for the town. He then reviewed the document above with the Board.

Ultimately the town would have to create a sewer district. Town law requires it. You have to prepare a map, plan, and report. It would show the area you are going to serve. The board would have to figure how you are paying for it and how are the users going to pay for it. If the cost is prohibitive state law won't allow you to do it.

Council Member Manning stated you have already delineated the area of the town center. He wondered should the town be looking at the areas to give us the lowest cost per household. The ultimate service will reach far beyond town center. Just Town Center was estimated to cost over a million dollars. By creating it every district is subject to permissive referendum. If a percentage of residents puts together a petition then it would have to be on the ballot. In the initial phase the chosen company would have meetings with the town. If the permissive referendum is voted up then it is a go. Part of the proposal is the board has to decide who is to be hooked up. If someone decided not to hook up would they still pay or would the cost be passed on to everyone else in the district.

It was asked if there is a cluster of homes with septic problems. The avenues was the response.

It was asked if the board had looked at all the proposals. Not all members had. Council Member Glenn stated we could give Senator Tedesco the list and see if they want to fund this. It was noted there are Department of Environmental Conservation Engineering Planning Grants. They fund 80% of the study up to a certain dollar amount.

The board wondered if the companies who submitted proposals will apply for grant money. The 3 lowest offered to do this type of work.

Mr. Mrazz stated we have to go under the assumption that the town will have to pay for the entire project. That is not the conversation the board has had. Council Member Glenn stated that Senator Tedesco said he would fund the first part of this project. The board has to be prepared if you apply. Council Member Sturchio can't see us on the hook for forty four thousand dollars.

Supervisor Morris went through this with Johnathan Piro from the Senators office. Council Member Glenn will call the Senators office. It is hard for the board to say we are going forward unless the funding is secured. Mr. Mraz stated he was 98.5% sure the town would get something.

Mr. Mraz supplies the board with the summary of scopes of work to prepare conceptual evaluation of potential Town of Caroga sewer system.

**SUMMARY OF SCOPES OF WORK TO PREPARE CONCEPTUAL EVALUATION OF POTENTIAL TOWN OF CAROGA SEWER SYSTEM**

TASK	DELAWARE ENGINEERING	BARTON & LOGUIDICE	ENVIRONMENTAL DESIGN PARTNERSHIP	C.T. MALE
1. Define Service Area	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Will identify 3 preliminary service areas</li> <li>Will present 3 options to Town to review</li> <li>Will estimate flows based on Real Property Tax (RPT) data</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Will conduct 3 meetings with Town to define Service Area</li> <li>Will develop phasing plan</li> <li>Will estimate flows based on RPT data</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Will conduct 3 meetings with Town to define Service Area</li> <li>Will develop phasing plan</li> <li>Will estimate flows based on RPT data and zoning</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Will conduct 3 meetings with Town to define Service Area</li> <li>Will develop phasing plan</li> <li>Will estimate flows from RPT data and zoning</li> </ul>
2. Identify Collection System	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Anticipates most cost effective collection system to be one with individual pumps and low pressure sewers</li> <li>Will use LIDAR topography to assess pipe lengths and number of pump stations and force mains</li> <li>Phasing Plan will be developed</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Will use publicly available USGS topo information to develop collection system and what areas could be gravity and what areas would be pumped</li> <li>Anticipates 3-phase buildout of collection system</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Will use drone technology to fly Service Area and develop three (3) dimensional point cloud surface and terrain models to assess areas that could be serviced by gravity and force mains</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Will use publicly available topographic information to develop collection system and what areas could be serviced by gravity and force mains</li> </ul>
3. Identify Wastewater Treatment Options	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Will use publicly available stream flow and water quality data to evaluate 3 sites for treatment plant</li> <li>Will consult with NYSDEC to obtain project SPEDES effluent discharge limits</li> <li>Will prepare comparative analysis of 3 creeks and transmitting wastewater to GJJWWTP</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Will work with Town to develop criteria to use to evaluate 3 sites for treatment plant</li> <li>Will use publicly available stream flow and water quality data to evaluate 3 creeks</li> <li>Will obtain projected SPEDES effluent discharge limits for each site from DEC</li> <li>Will prepare comparative analysis of 3 creeks and transmitting wastewater to GJJWWTP</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Will visit each stream and take flow measurements. Will use publicly available water quality data</li> <li>Will meet with NYSDEC to review 3 streams and obtain SPEDES discharge limits for each site</li> <li>Will prepare comparative analysis of 3 creeks and transmitting wastewater to GJJWWTP</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Will obtain stream flow and water quality data from all 3 streams</li> <li>Will meet with NYSDEC to review 3 streams and obtain SPEDES discharge limits for each site</li> <li>Will prepare comparative analysis of 3 creeks and transmitting wastewater to GJJWWTP</li> </ul>
4. Prepare Summary Report	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes</li> <li>Will meet with Town to present report</li> <li>25 copies will be provided</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes</li> <li>Will meet with Town to present report</li> <li>25 copies will be provided</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes</li> <li>Will meet with Town to present report</li> <li>25 copies will be provided</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes</li> <li>Will meet with Town to present report</li> <li>25 copies will be provided</li> </ul>
5. Other	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Will prepare CFA for Town Center Planning</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Will prepare CFA for funding through NYSDEC's EPC program for up to \$30,000 to expend on the feasibility study</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Will prepare CFA for expanded feasibility study</li> </ul>	
6. Schedule	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>3 months to complete</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>3 months to complete</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>3 months to complete</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>3 months to complete</li> </ul>
7. Overall Experience with Rural Wastewater Projects	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Excellent</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Excellent</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Excellent</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Excellent</li> </ul>
8. Overall Experience in Fulton County	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>None referenced in proposal</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Currently engineer for GJJWWTP</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Currently working for Fulton County on a number of water and wastewater projects</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Engineer for Groversville and Johnstown Water Departments</li> <li>Engineer on a number of local projects</li> </ul>
9. Fee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>\$ 7,530</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>\$ 9,600</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>\$11,300</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>\$13,322</li> </ul>

Council Member Manning won't entertain proposals that plan to discharge into Mead Creek, Mr. Mraz questioned why would that not be an option?

Mr. Long noted that package waste water will discharge solids, phosphorus, and nitrates. You don't want that in the tributaries of Caroga Lake which already have weeds. Mr. Mraz didn't know what DEC will set as discharge limits. The public perception will be hard to change. Mr. Mraz noted the Sacandaga has discharge going into it. He is not anticipating a system failure. You have to look at all your options. DEC may say they won't do it or that the flow may be OK. Mr. Mraz purposes the board look at all the options. It is the boards call.

Council Member Manning again stated the plan won't fly if it is being discharged into our lakes.

James Selmsler stated the board should talk to DEC first. If it goes to the next step then get them involved. Mr. Mraz stated the board will get a comparative analysis of the three options.

The location is part of the map, plan, and report. It was noted that we have to get the funding straightened out with Senator Tedesco's office.

Jim Mraz gave a hypothetical scenario "say we want to hire CT male – don't sign any contracts then go to the Senator and ask him what he can do for the town. Mr. Mraz stated nothing is official till you sign a contract. If the Senator got us 50% the board can sign or not sign the contract. Mr. Selmsler says that happens a lot. The project is approved for a certain amount then the project is turned down.

Supervisor Morris suggested reviewing and comparing the top four firms. (Least expensive) The Laberge Group over all, are excellent in terms of experience and value in Fulton County Delaware Engineering has not done work in Fulton County. Barton and Loguidice have experience also. Mr. Mraz noted the scope of the work needs to be reviewed. He noted Environmental Design Partnership is currently working on projects for the county. Ct Male has a lot of experience in Fulton County.

The board decided that Delaware Engineering was out. Council Member Manning was interested in Environmental Design Partnership or CT Male. Mr. Mraz stated why spend more.

Mr. Mraz talks the board into selecting Environmental Design Partnership for a cost of \$11,300.00. Council Member Glenn made a motion that the town will hire them for a cost not to exceed \$11,300.00. The board won't sign a contract until the board knows how much Senator Tedesco can secure for the funding of the project. Council Member Sturchio seconded the motion. All board members were in favor of the motion.

Mr. Mraz provides a maximum not to exceed agreement to the board.

Council Member Manning again noted he was not in favor of considering Mead Creek. He asked Mr. Mraz to tell Environmental Design Partnership not to even look at Mead Creek it would save money. Using lagoons if there is a small volume was suggested for the first phase. It was noted that Sherman's was permitted for 5000 gal. - perk into the ground. Mr. Long stated

the APA said it can't be used based on the projected volume. James Long noted he walked the property with the wet land biologist, we are very close to wetlands. Council Member Glen suggested running a pipe from Sherman's to the dam.

Most summer people can't vote here if you own property in the district you can vote on project. The dream is to connect Sherman's. It was asked if the town owns it do we pay into the sewage district, if we use it. Mr. Mraz discussed the "Edu's" Equivalent Dwelling Units. A single residential structure would be one Edu. A commercial building could be 4 Edu's. A hotel could be 20 Edu's.

The town will wait to hear back from Senator Tedesco for funding. That is where we stand on this. The town needed to know by the end of month. Mr. Mraz will send a thank you to other 7 applicants. Mr. Mraz stated that for phase 2, 3, and 4 the town can you go with different companies. When board hires a professional service you don't have to go out to bid. Mr. Mraz noted the value of staying with one company.

The Board thanked Mr. Mraz. The board will let him know what senator says.

**RESOLUTION #2017 -059 to hire a second Deputy Town Clerk** was offered by Supervisor Morris at the May 18<sup>th</sup>, 2017 Caroga Town Board work Session.

**WHEREAS**, Judith Aldinger Deputy Town Clerk recently sustained an injury to her arm, and

**WHEREAS**, the Town Clerk is scheduled to attend the International Institute of Municipal Clerks Meeting in two days, and

**WHEREAS**, the first Deputy needs assistance to conduct routine office duties, and

**WHEREAS**, the Town Clerk has contacted Adam Ferrari of 309 Cape Horn Road to assist Mrs. Aldinger as needed during the period of time she is dealing with this injury, now therefore be it

**RESOLVED**, that Adam Ferrari shall be the second Deputy Town Clerk with a rate of pay of \$10.00 an hour as needed. The motion was seconded by Council Member Manning.

Adopted by a vote of 4 Ayes; Morris, Glenn, Sturchio, Manning

The Town Clerk received notification from Majestic Fireworks of 29 College St. Clinton NY 13323 (315) 853-2237 for two displays taking place in the Town of Caroga. The Fireworks events are July 2<sup>nd</sup> at Canada Lake from a barge and on July 3<sup>rd</sup> at Pine Lake Park. Supervisor Morris has reviewed the applications and approved them. It was noted that the necessary proof of insurance papers have been submitted

**RESOLUTION2017-060 to set the rate of pay for the Youth Program** was offered by Council Member Manning at the May 18<sup>th</sup>, 2017 Caroga Town Board Work Session.

**WHEREAS**, the board met on Friday May 12, 2017 to interview and hire a youth director, and

**WHEREAS**, the board desires to set the salaries for the staff of the Youth Department changing from salaried to hourly, now therefore be it

**RESOLVED**, that the Caroga Town Board does hereby move to set the salaries for the youth department at an hourly rate of \$8.50 for new hires, \$8.75 for returning rehires, \$10.00 for the head counselor position, \$14.00 per hour for the Bus Driver.

Supervisor Morris seconded the motion.

Adopted by a vote of 4 Ayes; Morris, Glenn, Sturchio, Manning

Supervisor Morris noted that the Youth Department needed a Health Officer for the program. It is not a paid position. Council Member Dr. John Glenn accepted the position. A copy of his license will be obtained license. Supervisor Morris made a motion to appoint John Glenn MD to the health officer position for the Youth Program. Council Member Manning seconded the motion. All board members were in favor of the motion.

Council Member Manning noted only half of the committee members of the Sherman's Committee can make the Saturday June 17, 2017 morning meeting date. He offered a preferred date of Tuesday June 13<sup>th</sup>. Supervisor Morris noted that is the day before our monthly board meeting. The board discussed the time. A 6:30 pm meeting time was set. The Leader Herald newspaper will be notified. A notice will be put at the Post Office.

**RESOLUTION 2017-061 to set the meeting for the public presentation of the Sherman's Proposals** was offered by Council Member Manning at the May 18<sup>th</sup>, 2017 Caroga Town Board Work Session.

**WHEREAS**, the board discussed date of the previously set meeting for the public presentations of the Sherman's Proposals, and

**WHEREAS**, several of the committee members are not available on Saturday June 17, 2017, now therefore be it

**RESOLVED**, that the Caroga Town Board hereby sets the meeting for presentations by the applicants to the Sherman's Committee for Tuesday June 12, 2017 at 6:30 pm.

Council Member Sturchio seconded the motion.

Adopted by a vote of 4 Ayes; Morris, Glenn, Sturchio, Manning

Supervisor Morris made a motion to adjourn at 8:26 pm. Council Member Glenn seconded the motion. All board members were in favor of the motion.

Respectfully Submitted,

Linda M. Gilbert RMC, CMC  
Caroga Town Clerk